Simple Disjunction in Negative Contexts: Evidence from L1 Italian, French and Dutch

Elena Pagliarini*, Oana Lungu*, Angeliek van Hout*, Stephen Crain*, Maria Teresa Guasti*
*Universitat Pompeu Fabra, †Université de Nantes, ‡Rijksuniversiteit Groningen, §Macquarie University, ¶Università degli Studi di Milano-Bicocca

Introduction. We investigated the interpretation of sentences with negated disjunction “NOT A or B” in Italian, French, and Dutch learners. Our findings provide further support for the Semantic Subset Principle that explains children’s initial non-target-like interpretation of such sentences (Crain et al., 1994; Goro & Akiba, 2004; Notley et al., 2014). Moreover, Italian and French children converge to the adult setting earlier than their Japanese and Mandarin peers. We argue that the presence of negative concord in Italian and French plays a role here.

Background. English sentences like (1a) generate a conjunctive entailment—they are true in a situation where the cat did not eat either veggie. In contrast, in Japanese this entailment does not arise: sentences like (1) are true in three situations: a) no veggie was eaten, b) the carrot is not eaten, b) the pepper is not eaten. Goro (2004) and Crain (2012) propose that this cross-linguistic variation is determined by the Disjunctive Parameter: in English OR is a non-positive polarity item (−PPI) and scopes under negation (NEG>OR), whereas in Japanese OR is a +PPI and scopes over negation (OR>NEG) (Szabolcsi, 2002). Situations in which negative sentences with OR is −PPI are true form a subset of situations in which negative sentences with OR is +PPI are true. Crain argues that child grammar obeys the Semantic Subset Principle: children initially take OR to be a −PPI (the subset value); they revise this initial setting on the basis of positive evidence. Goro supports this prediction with 5-ya Japanese children, who generate a conjunctive entailment for sentences such as (1) like English speakers. Our study seeks to extend the cross-linguistic basis of the Subset Principle by testing its predictions in learners of three new languages--Italian, French and Dutch--two of which are typologically different from those already studied in that they are negative concord languages.

Our study. 61 children (18 Italian, M=5;02; 23 French, M=5;03; 20 Dutch, M=4;10) and 38 adults (12 French, 14 Italian and 12 Dutch) participated in a TVJ task modeled after Goro & Akiba (2004) with sentences like (1) in 3 conditions: (i) Silver Medal (only one veggie is eaten), (ii) Sad Face (no veggie is eaten) and (iii) Gold Medal (both are eaten). The crucial condition was Silver: if children interpret OR as a −PPI (as in English), they should reject this situation in all three languages. Results. Dutch children and adults consistently rejected the Silver condition, generating a conjunctive entailment. Some Italian and French children behaved like Dutch children and adults, suggesting that they have the subset value of the parameter, similar to Japanese and Mandarin children in previous studies. Other Italian and French children, however, accepted the Silver condition, with disjunction taking scope over negation, like the adults in these languages. Mixed-model logistic regression analyses on the Silver responses (fixed effects: language, age; random effects: item, subject) revealed: (i) a main effect of language: the Italian and French participants were more likely to accept the Silver medal condition than the Dutch ones (p < .01); no significant difference between French and Italian; (ii) an age-by-language interaction: Italian and French adults differ from Dutch adults (p < .001); Italian children differ from Dutch children (p < .01), French children do not differ from either the Italian or the Dutch children.

Conclusion. 4-5-ya Dutch, Italian and French children comply with the Semantic Subset Principle when acquiring negated disjunction: they interpreted sentences like (1) either like the adults of their language (Dutch) or like the adults of a “subset” language (French and Italian). Some French and Italian children have already converged on the adult grammar, in contrast to their Japanese and Mandarin peers. This presents a novel finding in the developmental track of negated disjunction. We propose that this earlier acquisition in French and Italian derives from the fact that these languages, unlike Japanese, are negative concord
languages and express the conjunctive entailment OR>NEG reading with another form: French: NEG .. nì.. ni; Italian: NEG.. nè....né (2). This alternative blocks the NEG>OR interpretation for (1b-c) and, as such, offers a cue to trigger the superset value of the Disjunction Parameter for French and Italian OR. Preliminary evidence from Italian learners shows that they indeed interpret nè... né sentences in (2a) like adults.

(1) a. The cat did not eat the carrot or the pepper. \textit{English}
b. Il gatto non ha mangiato la carota o il peperone. \textit{Italian}
c. Le chat n’a pas mangé la carotte ou le poivron. \textit{French}
d. De poes houdt niet van wortel of paprika. \textit{Dutch}

the cat loves not of carrot or pepper

(2) a. Il gatto non ha mangiato né la carota né il peperone. \textit{Italian}
b. Le chat n’a mangé ni la carotte ni le poivron. \textit{French}

the cat NEG ate neither the carrot neither the pepper

Figure 1. Samples of the Silver medal condition (left) and the Sad face condition (right).

Figure 2. Mean percentages of rejection in the Silver Medal and Sad Face conditions. Error bars represent percentage error.

References